

# MetroMonitor report: February 2024

14 MARCH 2024

---

**THE THIRD REPUBLIC**

**Authored by: Paul Berkowitz, Bella Mkhabela, and Buhle Mbokazi**



---

# Contents

Glossary .....	3
Parties and coalitions .....	4
Summary .....	5
ANC and EFF rift widens in Ekurhuleni and eThekweni.....	5
Metros scramble to shore up their finances.....	5
Protests increase as service delivery failures grow .....	5
Main report.....	6
Johannesburg .....	6
Service delivery .....	6
Tshwane .....	7
Service Delivery .....	7
Ekurhuleni.....	8
Service Delivery .....	9
Cape Town .....	9
Service Delivery .....	10
ethekweni.....	10
Service Delivery .....	11
Nelson Mandela Bay.....	11
Buffalo City .....	12
Service Delivery .....	13
Mangaung .....	13
Service Delivery .....	14

---

# Glossary

AGM	Annual General Meeting
CFO	Chief Financial Officer
COGTA	(Department of) Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs
DBSA	Development Bank of Southern Africa
DM	District Municipality
DAC	Department of Sports, Arts and Culture
DWS	Department of Water and Sanitation
GFIS	Group Forensic and Investigation Services (City of Johannesburg)
IDP	Integrated Development Plan
IPP	Independent Power Producer
JPC	Johannesburg Property Company
JRA	Johannesburg Roads Agency
Mayco	Mayoral Committee
ME	Municipal Entity
MEC	Member of the Executive Council
MFMA	Municipal Finance Management Act
MM / CM	Municipal Manager / City Manager
MMC	Member of the Mayoral Committee
MPAC	Municipal Public Accounts Committee
MPL	Member of the Provincial Legislature
MSA	Municipal Systems Act
MSDF	Mangaung Service Delivery Forum
NERSA	National Energy Regulator of South Africa
PR	Proportional Representation
PTT	Provincial Task Team
REC	Regional Executive Committee
RTT	Regional Task Team
SAMWU	South African Municipal Workers' Union
SANS	South African National Standards
SCA	Supreme Court of Appeal
SOCA	State of the City Address
SOE	State-owned Enterprise

---

## Parties and coalitions

AASD	Afrikan Alliance of Social Democrats
ABC	Abantu Batho Congress
ACC	Active Citizens Coalition
ACDP	African Christian Democratic Party
AIC	African Independent Congress
AIM	Abantu Integrity Movement
ANC	African National Congress
APC	African People's Convention
ATM	African Transformation Movement
CMP	Cape Muslim Party
COPE	Congress of the People
DA	Democratic Alliance
DOP	Defenders of the People
EFF	Economic Freedom Fighters
FF+	Freedom Front Plus
GLU	Government of Local Unity (ANC, EFF, PA, others)
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
IRASA	Independent Ratepayers Association of South Africa
MPC	Multi-Party Coalition (DA, ActionSA, IFP, FF+, ACDP, others)
NA	Northern Alliance
PA	Patriotic Alliance
PAC	Pan Africanist Congress
RCT	Republican Conference of Tshwane
UDM	United Democratic Movement
UIM	United Independent Movement

---

# Summary

## ANC and EFF rift widens in Ekurhuleni and eThekweni

The fallout in Ekurhuleni from the [delayed Auditor-General's report](#) weakened the already fragile relationship between the ANC and the EFF. While the ANC apportioned most of the blame to [the mayor, an AIC councillor](#), the ANC-led provincial government was set to investigate both the mayor and [speaker Nthabiseng Tshivhenga](#). Tshivhenga is an EFF councillor. EFF leader Julius [Malema also blamed former mayor](#) Mzwandile Masina for the metro's state.

In eThekweni the [EFF voted with the DA and IFP](#) to remove the mayor, an ANC councillor. EFF councillor Themba Mvubu was [removed from his chairperson position](#), possibly in retaliation.

## Metros scramble to shore up their finances

The financial health of all the metros continued to decline. [Johannesburg](#), Tshwane, and [Nelson Mandela Bay](#) were all threatened by National Treasury with grant reductions due to their chronic underspending.

[Tshwane](#) announced a financial recovery plan with a strong focus on [debt collection](#) and credit control. City Power has [cost Johannesburg R1-billion every month](#) as a result of its underbilling. In Buffalo City, the [embattled development agency](#) turned to the private sector to complete its overdue projects as council [refused to give it another R42-million](#).

## Protests increase as service delivery failures grow

Communities across the metros protested poor service delivery - in some cases the service delivery failures had persisted for years. In Johannesburg, communities from [Ennerdale, Yeoville and Bellevue](#) took to the streets. Residents from Salvokop, Tshwane called for the [removal of their ward councillor](#) while communities from Mamelodi and other parts of Tshwane planned a huge [service delivery march](#).

---

# Main report

## Johannesburg

According to a [financial report](#) which was submitted to the Joburg council, City Power costs the metro R1-billion a month.

A Johannesburg [CBD building caught fire](#), leaving more than 50 people homeless. An investigation was lodged to determine the cause of the fire.

City Power was given the go-ahead to enter into a [20-year deal with IPPs](#).

The [DA demanded that city manager Floyd Brink step aside](#) while the court deliberated on his appointment. It was alleged that Brink's appointment was illegal. The DA was left unhappy after the court dismissed the case. According to the party further steps will be taken to challenge the court's ruling.

City manager [Floyd Brink was found in contempt of court](#) after a local business's water was cut off. The business had flagged the city for a query after a high increase on their water bill was issued.

The metro was informed by the National [Treasury](#) that they risked getting cut for funding due to underperformance and noncompliance in the spending of grants. The municipality was expected to provide reasons to the National Treasury as to why the funds should not be reverted back.

[The Johannesburg High Court](#) ruled in favour of the 77 Samwu workers who were dismissed by the metro after their contracts were changed from fixed term to permanent.

## Service delivery

The [northern suburbs of Joburg were affected by a water outage](#) after a pipe burst. The city shut down water for repairs but several residents complained that they did not have water after repairs were completed. [Residents in Parkview](#) were unhappy about the city's deteriorating water infrastructure after they were left battling water shortages for eight months after a pipe burst.

Residents in [Ennerdale staged a service delivery protest](#), barricading roads leading in and out of the area. Residents demanded that the city put an end to electricity and water outages.

Residents in [Yeoville and Bellevue](#) staged a protest after over prolonged power cuts. The DA ward councillor handed a [petition](#) to suspend load shedding while repairs were done to the Observatory power station.

---

## Tshwane

Opposition parties in the municipality criticised the metro for creating a new position which according to the opposition will set the metro back financially. A full-time chairperson of an oversight committee position was created and FF+ councillor Saakie du Plooy was appointed to take over the position.

Deputy mayor Nasiphi Moya paid back the money from a travel allowance she did not take.

The metro planned on recovering debts owed by customers by enforcing the “Tshwane Ya Tima revenue-collection” campaign. The campaign targets households, businesses and estates that owe the city and disconnects services provided by the municipality.

The metro’s mayor, Cilliers Brink announced the city’s financial recovery plan. According to Brink the city would be taking on a “bold five-point plan”. The municipality planned on collecting R23.3-billion revenue owed to it by customers. The city also announced that it owed Eskom R3.9-billion and if it failed to pay it would be forced to make changes in how it provided services. According to Brink the biggest contributing factor to Tshwane’s financial crisis was caused by the recent strike, The city was unable to collect revenue as per normal and had to spend R200-million to protect the city's infrastructure.

The ANC called for an administrative team to run the metro and for mayor Cilliers Brink to step down. This was after the metro was in danger of forfeiting a R629.6-million grant from the National Treasury.

The metro’s city manager, Johann Mettler was accused of overstepping his mandate by proposing a salary increase to labour unions during a negotiation which was facilitated by the CCMA. Mettler proposed a 5.4% increase under the conditions that the city collected its R4.4-billion revenue.

## Service Delivery

President Cyril Ramaphosa slammed the metro for failing to resolve the water crisis in Mamelodi Phase 4, After conducting an oversight visit in the area, residents complained of not having water for close to four years.

Residents of Salvokop demanded that their councillor, Fortune Mampuru be axed for failing to attend to their service delivery complaints. A memorandum of demands was handed over to MMC, Kingsley Wakelin during a staged march by the angry residents.

The mayor, Cilliers Brink reported that the metro had received positive feedback from 39 companies after sending out a Request For information to procure power from IPPs.

---

[Residents in Mamelodi and other regions planned a massive service delivery strike](#) to Tshwane House. The residents planned on addressing water shortages and high municipal bills amongst other service delivery issues.

## Ekurhuleni

The EFF in Gauteng expressed alarm over the City of Ekurhuleni's [delayed audit report](#), accusing the [Auditor-General](#) of political meddling. According to the EFF, the AGSA was required to provide the financial report within three months of receipt, which was four months later than the legal deadline. The party maintained that there was no reasonable justification for the delay. The Auditor-General [denied delaying the publishing of the metro's 2022/23 financial accounts](#).

The provincial government intended to [probe mayor Sivuyile Ngodwana and Speaker Nthabiseng Tshivhenga](#) for neglecting to submit the Auditor-General's findings at the council session. The metro disputed claims that it withheld the [2022/23 audit report from the Auditor-General](#). The city's finance spokesman, Fanyana Nkosi, accused the mayor, council speaker, city manager, and MMC of Finance of concealing the study and its negative conclusions.

A metro employee was apprehended while driving a vehicle loaded with [stolen electrical cable worth R1.2-million](#). The employee reportedly submitted false documentation for the cable release. The municipality loses more than R90-million each year owing to cable theft.

[ActionSA filed a motion of no confidence](#) against Ekurhuleni mayor Sivuyile Ngodwana in an effort to "save the city from the brink of collapse". Ngodwana, elected by the coalition of the ANC and the EFF, has been chastised for failing to run the city, claiming declining service delivery and financial status since his election.

ActionSA aimed to secure a [motion of no confidence \(MONC\)](#) against Mayor Sivuyile Ngodwana, with certain members of the ruling ANC/EFF combination voting against him. The [motion](#) will be presented to the programming committee and approved for tabling at the [February council meeting](#).

Former mayor Mzwandile Masina denied accusations by Julius Malema of being involved in [sabotage efforts](#), claiming that the charges were false and intended to ruin his name.

The ANC in Ekurhuleni criticised the DA for proposing the removal of at least [250 EMPD employees](#) with criminal histories.

The [ANC Youth League called for a motion of no confidence against Ekurhuleni Mayor](#) Sivuyile Ngodwana, accusing him of poor leadership and deterioration in the city's finances, service delivery, and execution of a council decision on stolen buildings.



---

[Eskom will take over load shedding in the metro](#) due to the metro's failure to comply with load shedding regulations.

### Service Delivery

An 11-year-old child died after slipping into a water-filled excavation trench near Wattville. The metro said that the [tragedy might have been prevented if the fence had not been taken](#). The boy's family blamed the event on the government, alleging it was caused by an unfinished RDP project in 2017.

## Cape Town

The second round of public hearings on the [DA's Western Cape Provincial Powers Bill](#) was halted owing to a capacity issue. The ANC objected to the hearings, alleging that they did not recognise the constitutional obligation to open it up to the public.

Despite a bountiful harvest, logistical challenges at the [Port of Cape Town](#) resulted in a 14% decline in deciduous fruit volumes.

Cape Town was embroiled in a legal struggle with [Singabalapha informal settlement inhabitants](#) after housing advocacy organisation Ndifuna Ukwazi questioned the use of the Emergency Housing Programme in their eviction.

[Homeless people in Green Point](#) faced an impending eviction order. The Western Cape High Court issued a final eviction notice in December, requiring 37 individuals to evacuate by the end of January.

Cape Town is developing a [low-cost housing alternative for "micro-developers"](#) to create rental units in the city's most inexpensive formal neighbourhoods. The mayoral committee adopted a policy that would pay 90% of development rates for bulk services. The city wants to support the small-scale building industry through the subsidy arrangement.

Mayor Geordin Hill-Lewis encouraged President Cyril Ramaphosa to resolve [the city's concerns](#) over devolving passenger rail operations to the metro. The city's rail feasibility assessment found that functioning rail would save R932-million per year, support over 51 000 jobs, and add R11-billion to the local economy.

Hill-Lewis criticised Finance Minister Enoch Godongwana's [reduction of R500-million in grants over two years](#).

Parliament questioned officials over the transfer of [800 families from the Metrorail Central Line](#) in

---

Philippi to property along the R300 route. The City and Prasa accused each other of lying in their submissions.

## Service Delivery

Thando Pimpi, a Khayelitsha councillor, raised concerns about the growing number of holes created by [illicit sand mining](#), notably in Ward 93. The matter had been highlighted at public meetings but was not resolved.

The city paid [R25.8-million in feed-in tariffs and incentives](#) to companies and homes selling excess electricity. The city paid more than R10.5-million in 2022/23, and R8.8-million in 2023/24. The metro is the first in the country to purchase excess electricity from rooftop solar.

Cape Town suburbs, including Mitchells Plain, Hanover Park, Manenberg, Gugulethu, and Nyanga, experienced [increased crime due to the lack of functioning streetlights](#). Burnt or stolen cables have caused the lights to remain out of order for several years, allowing criminals to exploit the situation and engage in covert activities.

The City of Cape Town was granted a [final eviction order to remove homeless people](#) from the Foreshore area. The court also ordered the eviction of homeless people from other city-owned public spaces. The Socio-Economic Rights Institute of South Africa (SERI) [expressed concern about](#) the order.

The city [evicted 37 homeless](#) people who were living on tennis courts in Green Point, South Africa, after a final eviction judgement issued by the Western Cape High Court in December 2023.

[Residents of Bromwell Street](#) have been resisting evictions for ten years due to inability to afford other housing options. The case emerged after their homes were bought by private developers in 2013.

## Ethekwini

[Political parties were concerned with the “manipulated” audit](#) received by the metro. According to EFF councillor, Themba Mvubu, Mayor Mxolisi Kaunda promised an improvement in service delivery. Mvubu highlighted the worsened situation in Phoenix. The [DA proposed a motion of no confidence](#) against the mayor for allegedly failing to resolve the issues in the metro but a majority of the council voted against it. The [ANC-EFF coalition in the metro was in danger](#) after the EFF voted with the DA and IFP to have the mayor removed. The party also denied having a coalition agreement with the ANC.

The DA set a motion to [dissolve council](#). The DA’s decision came after the EFF voted to have Mxolisi Kaunda removed. [The motion to dissolve council](#) was unsuccessful despite service delivery failure

---

which the DA emphasised on. According to DA councillor, Mzamo Billy, the party had been fighting on its own in the attempt to get the service delivery crisis resolved.

EFF councillor Themba Mvubu was [removed from the Human Settlement and Infrastructure Services chairperson position](#). According to ANC provincial secretary, Bheki Mtolo, Mvubu was removed due to performance issues and failing to resolve water and power issues in the metro.

[Allegations of misuse of 8 000 fleet vehicles](#) were made during a council meeting by DA caucus leader, Mzamo Billy. According to Billy there were incidents where employees were found sleeping and indulging in alcohol in these vehicles.

A case was opened against a municipal employee who [was caught tampering with CCTV camera cables](#). It was alleged that Mlungisi Mondlana, who works as a camera operator, cut and removed cables which were connected to a server at a municipal building. In addition [two more employees were arrested for stealing diesel](#) belonging to the municipality.

[Water and Sanitation minister](#) Senzo Mchunu warned opposition parties to refrain from “politicising” the water crisis in the metro. According to Mchunu, using the water crisis on the party's manifesto can be an infringement on human rights when there becomes a failure to provide the service.

[Municipal workers in the metro downed their tools](#) after discovering that they were paid less than workers in other metros. The municipality obtained a [court interdict](#) preventing workers from trashing the city and turning the strike violent.

### Service Delivery

The [Verulam water committee](#) was left disappointed after they received no answer from the municipality regarding the water crisis in the community.

## Nelson Mandela Bay

Fraud-accused city manager [Noxolo Nqwazi](#) was implicated in fraud worth millions of rands during a council meeting. The charges include Nqwazi's failure to conduct a background check before employing the chief operations officer, Christopher Dyani.

Metro officials, including housing delivery head [Mvuleni Mapu](#), [resumed work](#), raising questions about accountability and the municipality's leadership. Mapu was arrested in August 2020 over a R12.8-million tender and charged along with Nqwazi, ANC regional secretary Luyolo Nqakula, and three former DA councillors.

---

The metro's council dismissed a request for a separation agreement from [city manager Noxolo Nqwazi](#). The council accused Nqwazi of demanding "out of this world" terms during discussions.

The Patriotic Alliance's national chairperson, Marlon Daniels, accused mayor Gary van Niekerk of [removing Nqwazi](#) due to her perceived danger to his position. Daniels alleged that van Niekerk told him he had to remove Nqwazi as a councillor.

Council declined to address [a motion of emergency over student transport concerns](#) affecting over 900 students. The motion, brought by DA member Jason Grobbelaar, demanded immediate interaction with the transport MEC to commit to the system's availability.

The mayor held an urgent meeting with committee members and executive directors to draft an action plan to [avoid losing over half a billion rand in grant funding](#). National Treasury warned that several grants, amounting to approximately R520-million, could be cut due to under-spending.

Anele Qaba, CEO of the Mandela Bay Development Agency was considered [ineligible for the post](#) and may be collecting excessive taxpayer funds, according to an affidavit signed by suspended city manager Noxolo Nqwazi. This appointment resulted in the National Treasury withholding more than R700-million in equitable share grant cash, forcing projects to be delayed.

Mayor Gary van Niekerk was [criticised for making empty promises](#) at a [council meeting](#) by ACDP leader Lance Grootboom.

A [council meeting was disrupted](#) by councillors expressing disapproval of speaker Eugene Johnson, claiming she lacked knowledge of council rules. Lance Grootboom criticised Johnson for referring Grootboom and GOOD councillor Lawrence Troon to the city's rules and ethics committee for "misbehaving."

## Buffalo City

[Ayanda Gqoboka](#), the head of the Buffalo City Metro Development Agency, promised to properly account for the R200-million spent on contentious projects such as the Baby Lee Jegels Park. The agency is in the spotlight for the park's watered-down design, which has become a political controversy.

The provincial government called for [disciplinary action](#) against the metro's councillors who failed to disclose their financial interests.

---

The metro issued an ["amnesty" to homeowners who steal power by tampering with their meter boxes](#). Since early 2023, the city has been vigorously seeking to reclaim arrears payments through prepaid power sales. The city will replace the boxes for free, rather than charging R10 000 for them.

Nolitha Pietersen, [chair of the Buffalo City Metro Development Agency](#), resigned in January, despite the fact that the municipality and the agency kept the announcement under wraps. The agency required R42-million to finish the projects and turned to the private sector after the metro declined to make further cash available. The agency was also under fire for releasing [false historical facts](#) on East London during King Phalo's reign.

The metro was dealing with a rise of [abandoned and hijacked buildings](#), posing a hazard to people and businesses. The city's law enforcement identified 45 problematic properties, primarily in East London

The metro's [2022/23 annual report](#) identified a number of challenges, including financial sustainability, road infrastructure collapse, vandalism, theft, supply chain management, and climate change.

The metro's [municipal public accounts committee](#) was questioned for arranging accommodations for councillors attending a meeting at the East London International Convention Centre. Opposition parties questioned the committee's choice to book lodging during the city's cost-cutting initiatives.

The metro increased security measures after [criminals attacked its cash-handling facilities](#). Acting CFO Vincent Pillay revealed theft at the metro's facilities at a council meeting, shocking councillors.

## Service Delivery

Buffalo City's [infrastructure woes](#) resulted in two sewage overflows at Gonubie Beach, forcing the beach to stay closed.

The metro repaired [7 000 potholes](#) in five months since the commencement of the Operation Valazonke programme. R89-million was allotted for road repairs, stormwater upkeep, and material purchases.

## Mangaung

The [metro's spokesperson, Qondile Khedama](#) reported that efforts were made to restore the state of the metro. The city tackled long standing issues such as illegal parking, waste management and infrastructural challenges.

In efforts to find solutions on the [ongoing service delivery challenges](#) faced by the metro, the DA in the metro met with the city's municipal manager, Sello More. The DA addressed water supply challenges,

---

stormwater repair management challenges, road maintenance challenges amongst other challenges faced by the metro.

### **Service Delivery**

The metro shut down water supply for urgent repairs, The DA in the metro addressed how the lack of communication by the city manager and mayor deprived the community of the service delivery they were entitled to. The party also met with mayor Sello More to address various service delivery issues.